

BULLETIN NO. 63:

Comparing the Rev. 4 of Chapter 2 on International Peace and Security to the Rev. 3











PROJECT TEAM: Jebilson Raja Joslin (*Lead Author, Bulletin No. 63*), Eliane El Haber, Fergus Watt, Ishaan Shah, Javier Surasky, Jeffery Huffines, Laeek Siddiqui and Mwendwa Kiogora.



Comparing the Rev. 4 of Chapter 2 on International Peace and Security to the Rev. 3

ABOUT: The co-facilitators of the Summit of the Future (SOTF), following informal consultations and written inputs from MS and stakeholders in December 2023, published the <u>zero-draft</u> of the Pact for the Future on 26 January 2024. The 5-chapter zero-draft was meant to serve as a starting point for formal intergovernmental negotiations leading up to the SOTF in September 2024.

A chapter-by-chapter First Reading was organized in early February following which a 242-page compilation text around the skeleton of the zero draft was circulated among Member States (MS). A paragraph-by-paragraph Second Reading was organised intermittently from late February until early April following which a 224-page revised compilation text was circulated among MS on 3 April 2024 (refer to ICH bulletin #27 for the First and Second Readings). The Rev. 1 of the Pact for the Future was released on 14 May 2024 following closed informal consultation at Ambassador level and a virtual consultation with MGoS and civil society in April and the UN Civil Society Conference in Nairobi in May. The Rev. 1, as outlined by the co-facilitators in their letter dated 4 April, was meant to be a concise, action-oriented and high-level political document as opposed to the zero-draft, which was meant to serve as a starting point for formal negotiations (refer to ICH bulletin #37 comparing the Rev. 1 and the zero-draft).

The <u>Rev. 2</u> of the Pact for the Future was released on 17 July following extensive Third Readings held dispersedly between late May to early July (refer to <u>ICH bulletin #45</u> comparing the Rev. 2 to the Rev. 1 and the zero-draft). Following further consultations in late July and August, the co-facilitators released the <u>Rev. 3</u> on 27 August (refer to <u>ICH bulletin #58</u> comparing the Rev. 3 to the Rev. 2, Rev. 1 and the zero-draft). Following the breaking of silence on Rev. 3 by a number of MS, the co-facilitators organized small group meetings to identify bridging proposals and released the <u>Rev. 4</u> on 13 September 2024. This ICH bulletin #63 compares the Rev. 4 of Ch. 2 on International Peace and Security to the Rev. 3. Only the changes made in Rev. 4 are discussed here. In instances where the language stayed the same in Rev. 3 and Rev. 4, potentially indicating consensus among MS, it is NOT discussed in this bulletin.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The Rev. 4 of Ch. 2 of the Pact for the Future has made some subtle but significant changes to the Rev. 3. The word "new" has been removed from action 16c regarding mechanisms for the pacific settlement of disputes indicating lesser appetite among MS to develop and implement "new" mechanisms. The language on national prevention strategies in action 18d has been changed from "develop" to "consider developing" indicating a lesser commitment on the same.

Language on action 20a regarding youth has seen significant changes. "Take concrete measures" is now, take concrete "voluntary" measures; "to ensure" that youth can "participate" in decision-making is now, "increase" the inclusive "representation" of youth; and the scope is limited to prevention and resolution of conflict in Rev. 4 as opposed to a broader "peace and security" language in Rev. 3.

The Rev. 4 has significantly changed the language in Action 21 on climate change and peace & security. The Rev. 4 explicitly states that the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) is the primary "international, intergovernmental forum" for negotiating the global response to climate change. The Rev. 3 request for "relevant United Nations' intergovernmental organs (to) consider and address within their respective mandates, the implications for international peace and security of the adverse effects of climate change" has been removed, and instead replaced with an open-ended language to take into account and deepen our understanding of the role of climate change in sustaining peace.

Action 26 on nuclear weapons continues to be contentious among MS as of Rev. 4 (13 September 2024). The scene-setting paragraph has removed language "recognize(ing) that the verifiable, irreversible and total elimination of nuclear weapons is the only absolute guarantee against their use". In the action items 26a and



26b, the language "disarmament under (strict and) effective international control" has been removed when referring only to elimination of nuclear weapons but kept in the "final" objective of general and complete disarmament, which we assume includes nuclear weapons. The Lead Author believes that this change shifts the emphasis of "disarmament under effective international control" from nuclear weapons to, on or after some probable future final objective of general disarmament.

The Rev. 4 has removed language calling on nuclear-weapon States "to provide assurances (the Lead Author assumes it is new assurances) against the use or threat of use of nuclear weapons against non-nuclear-weapon States". Although the Rev. 4 mentions "associated assurances against the use or threat of use of nuclear weapons", it seems to indicate existing assurances and has removed the explicit mention of use or threat of use "against non-nuclear-weapon States".

The Rev. 4 requests the Secretary-General (SG) to update MS on new and emerging technologies specifically "through the SG's report on current developments in science and technology". However, language "to support MS 'future' consideration of these issues" has been removed, signaling less or no appetite among MS at the moment for even "future" consideration of these additional issues, if any.

HEADLINES:

- Rule of law at the international level (in addition to national level) has been given more emphasis in Rev. 4, including through the addition of the following sentence in the introductory paragraphs for Ch. 2 – "We reaffirm the imperative of upholding and promoting the rule of law at the international level ...".
- "enhancing human security" has been rephrased to "addressing the challenges to the survival, livelihood and dignity of all people".
- Reference to General Assembly resolution 46/182 on humanitarian access in armed conflict has been brought back. It was found in the zero-draft but was removed in Rev. 1, Rev. 2 and Rev. 3.
- Following Action Item (14h as of Rev. 3) has been removed "Commit to support timely and decisive action, in particular by the Security Council and General Assembly, aimed at preventing and ending genocide, war crimes, crimes against humanity and the crime of aggression".
- The scope for action 18f has been limited to the risks associated with the "illicit trade" of small arms and light weapons in Rev. 4 as opposed to, presumably, all risks associated with small arms and light weapons in Rev. 3.
- Countries experiencing instability and conflict has been emphasized in the language for action 21b on implementing commitments on climate change, including financial ones.
- The scope of interpretation of "UN peace operations" has been explicitly stated as peacekeeping operations and special political missions in OP43 (presumably excluding other forms of UN peace operations such as the envisaged peace enforcement operations with regional organizations).
- Language proposing to address the risks posed by misinformation and disinformation to UN peace personnel has been removed in Rev. 4.
- References to "ensure that the world's waterways are safe, open for trade and enable all States to thrive" and "threats to critical infrastructure and disruptions to trade and economic activities and maritime interests" have been removed in Rev. 4.
- Rev. 4 welcomes the elaboration of the draft UN Convention against Cybercrime, which is new in the Pact for the Future.
- The language on reducing the risk of nuclear conflict has changed from "make every effort, especially nuclear-weapon States" in Rev. 3 to a "recognition" of the immediate goal to eliminate the danger of nuclear war.
- The Rev. 4 has deleted action 26b of Rev. 3 which proposed MS to "Undertake further efforts, especially by the nuclear-weapon States, to reduce and ultimately eliminate all types of nuclear



- weapons ... including by taking steps to critically review the role and significance of nuclear weapons in all military and security concepts, doctrines and policies and avoiding a nuclear arms race".
- Action 27a now proposes to start preparations for a 4th special session of the General Assembly devoted to disarmament (SSOD-IV). The language in Rev. 3 was to "hold" SSOD-IV.
- Action 27f has added a qualifier of "relevant" to promote aspects of mine action in Rev. 4. The language in Rev. 3 was without a qualifier to promote all aspects of mine action.
- Action 28a is relatively more specific in terms of the action needed now with the change of language from "advance discussions" to "advance further measures and appropriate international negotiations" to prevent an arms race in outer space.
- The Rev. 4 now specifies the Group of Governmental Experts on Emerging Technologies in the Area of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) as the intergovernmental process in which to advance with urgency discussions on LAWS.
- The Rev. 4 language is watered down to a "reaffirmation of voluntary, non-binding" norms of responsible State behaviour in the use of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) as opposed to "Uphold (which is relatively more action-oriented than a reaffirmation) ... agreed norms, rules and principles of responsible State behaviour" in Rev. 3.
- The Rev. 4 has added a reaffirmation in 29c that "additional norms (on ICTs) could continue to be developed over time and that the further development of norms, and the implementation of existing norms are not mutually exclusive but could take place in parallel".

RESOURCES:

- 1. Rev. 4 of the Pact for the Future
- 2. Rev. 3 of the Pact for the Future
- 3. Rev. 2 of the Pact for the Future
- 4. Rev. 1 of the Pact for the Future
- 5. Compilation text (as of 3 April 2024)
- 6. Zero draft of the Pact for the Future
- 7. <u>Letter from the co-facilitators</u> (dated 4 April 2024)