

## **BULLETIN NO. 52**

# Comparison of the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) Inputs on Reform of the United Nations Security Council

Comparison of Rev.5











**PROJECT TEAM:** Ishaan Shah (*Lead Author, Bulletin No. 52*), Eliane El Haber, Fergus Watt, Jebilson Raja Joslin, Jeffery Huffines and Mwendwa Kiogora

DISCLAIMER: This bulletin aims to provide recent updates and is not a complete summary or official record of the SOTF proceedings. It has been prepared independently and does not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any collaborating organizations. For further details, please reach out to Fergus Watt at ferguswatt6@gmail.com. The content is freely distributed as it is not copyrighted.

## Comparison of the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) Inputs on Reform of the United Nations Security Council

#### **About:**

The Permanent Representatives of Austria and Kuwait to the United Nations in New York have been the Co-Chairs of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other related matters to the Security Council (IGN) during the 78th session of the General Assembly.

Rev.5 of the IGN contribution was circulated on 12<sup>th</sup> August 2024 and is the final revised version of the IGN contribution to the Pact for the Future that is intended to be submitted to the Co-Facilitators of the Summit of the Future (Germany and Namibia). This language contains some minor changes and updates in comparison to the language of Rev.4 circulated on 3 July 2024, which are mostly of a technical and editorial nature and aim to bring the text in line with the language of the Rev.2 of the Pact for the Future that completed its negotiation on August 9<sup>th</sup>, 2024.

Rev.5 of the IGN contribution was developed after extensive consultations held with delegations. The Co-Chairs have voiced their confidence that the text now enjoys the "widest possible political acceptance among delegations". The justification for this being the final revised version is because the Co-Chairs believe that this text provides the best compromise achievable, striking a fair balance between the various positions expressed in the framework of the IGN while maintaining a high level of ambition, as well as concrete and forward-looking commitments on substance, process and interim measures while leaving the options open with regard to key issues, where there is no consensus at this stage.

The language of this Rev.5 text will form the basis of the continuation of the IGN's work at its next session, combined with an additional mandate from world leaders and heads of state and government who will adopt this language in the Pact for the Future.

### **Methodology:**

This Bulletin endeavours to provide an overview and comparison of how the initial draft of the IGN input (1 May, 2024) has evolved over time to form the latest version (as of 12 August, 2024). The key terminology, language, and paragraphs that were removed, modified, maintained, or added will be identified.

The structure of Rev.1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 are similar with 3 Actions items followed by operative paragraphs. The Zero Draft has a different structure. To provide a comprehensive analysis of the IGN inputs, the latest Rev.5 will be compared with its previous Rev.4 and Rev.3 iterations. All direct quotes and language from the texts have been italicised. Other comments have been made by the lead author of this bulletin.

#### **Resources:**

• Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) <u>Draft Input</u>

**DISCLAIMER**: This bulletin aims to provide recent updates and is not a complete summary or official record of the SOTF proceedings. It has been prepared independently and does not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any collaborating organizations. For further details, please reach out to Fergus Watt at ferguswatt6@gmail.com. The content is freely distributed as it is not copyrighted.

- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) Rev.1
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) Rev.2
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) Rev.3
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) Rev.4
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) Rev.5
- All relevant information, documents, and statements on the intergovernmental negotiations on Security Council reform (IGN).
- Zero Draft of the Pact for the Future
- Rev.1 of the Pact for the Future

#### **Highlights:**

- Delegations raised the point that the language contained in the IGN input to the Pact for the Future should be more concise and adapted to the purposes of a high-level document. Some delegations mentioned that the language should be "leader-like". Others stressed the need for clear, operative and ambitious results.
- Only minor changes have been made in the latest version of the IGN input for readability and minor technical reasons.
- Rev.5 (the latest iteration) of the IGN input is split into three core action items:
  - 1. Action 1: We will reform the UN Security Council, recognizing the urgent need to make it more representative, inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable.
  - 2. Action 2: We will strengthen our efforts in the framework of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on Security Council Reform as a matter of priority and without delay.
  - 3. Action 3: We will strengthen the response of the Security Council for the maintenance of international peace and security and its relationship with the General Assembly.

General references / language that were found in the Draft Input, Rev.1, Rev.2, Rev.3, and Rev.4 that have been removed in Rev.5 of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other related matters to the Security Council (IGN). Note that this is not an exhaustive list:

- Recalling our appeal for Security Council Reform of 2005
- Webcasting of parts of the IGN sessions
- Introducing a repository of the IGN with a dedicated website
- Overall range of 21-27 seats
- Note 507
- Increasing the frequency and improving the conduct of Security Council missions
- Fully making use of the different meeting formats available
- Committing to not vote against a credible draft resolution before the Security Council
- Permanent Members committing to not prevent the Security Council from taking action

**DISCLAIMER**: This bulletin aims to provide recent updates and is not a complete summary or official record of the SOTF proceedings. It has been prepared independently and does not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any collaborating organizations. For further details, please reach out to Fergus Watt at ferguswatt6@gmail.com. The content is freely distributed as it is not copyrighted.

- Situations involving the commission of mass atrocities by the use of the veto
- Request the President of the General Assembly to appoint Co-Chairs for the Intergovernmental Negotiations in order to immediately continue negotiations
- Call on Member States to provide the President of the General Assembly with the necessary resources to support the process of Security Council reform and in this regard consider the establishment of a dedicated unit in the Office of the President of the General Assembly for the Security Council reform process
- Request the Secretary General to ensure the provision of the necessary expertise, especially through the Office of Legal Affairs, the Security Council Affairs Division and the Department for General Assembly and Conference Management (DGACM) as appropriate and as requested by the Co-Chairs and OPGA.
- Adopt a resolution clarifying the interpretation of the term "party to a dispute" in Art. 27 (3) of the UN Charter in order to ensure the full implementation of this provision
- Examine the establishment of a mechanism that ensures automatic consequences in the case of grave violations of the UN Charter.

### **Comparison:**

Rev.3	Rev.4	Rev.5	Comments
Action 1: We will reform the UN Security Council, recognizing the urgent need to make it more representative, inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable.	Action 1: We will reform the UN Security Council, recognizing the urgent need to make it more representative, inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable.	Action 1: We will reform the UN Security Council, recognizing the urgent need to make it more representative, inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable.	The language of Action 1 has remained consistent across Rev.3, Rev.4, and Rev.5.
1. In response to the growing urgency to increase the effectiveness of the United Nations' abilities to	1. In response to the growing urgency to increase the effectiveness of the United Nations' abilities to maintain	1. In response to the growing urgency to increase the effectiveness of the United Nations' abilities to maintain	In paragraph 1 of Rev.4 and Rev.5, reference to "and taking into account our commitments of Agenda 2030" which featured in paragraph 1 of Rev.3 has been deleted.

**DISCLAIMER**: This bulletin aims to provide recent updates and is not a complete summary or official record of the SOTF proceedings. It has been prepared independently and does not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any collaborating organizations. For further details, please reach out to Fergus Watt at <a href="ferguswatt6@gmail.com">ferguswatt6@gmail.com</a>. The content is freely distributed as it is not copyrighted.

maintain international peace and security as set out in the UN Charter, and taking into account our commitments of Agenda 2030, we agree to the following guiding principles identified in the *Interaovernmental* Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Council (IGN) in accordance with decision 62/557 of the General Assembly as parameters for reform:

international peace and security as set out in the UN Charter, we agree to the following guiding principles identified in the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Council (IGN) in accordance with decision 62/557 of the General Assembly as parameters for reform:

international peace and security as set out in the UN Charter, we agree on the following guiding principles identified in the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matters related to the Council (IGN) in accordance with decision 62/557 of the General Assembly as parameters for reform:

- (a) Redress the historical injustice against Africa as a priority and, while treating Africa as a special case, improve the representation of the underrepresented and unrepresented regions and groups.
- (a) Redress the historical injustice against Africa as a priority and, while treating Africa as a special case, improve the representation of the underrepresented and unrepresented regions and groups.
- (a) Redress the historical injustice against Africa as a priority and, while treating Africa as a special case, improve the representation of the underrepresented and unrepresented regions and groups, such as Asia-Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean.
- In paragraph 1 (a) of Rev.5, language on "such as Asia-Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean" has been added to the text.

- (b) Enlarge the Security Council in order to be more representative of the current membership and reflective of the realities of the contemporary world and
- (b) Enlarge the Security Council in order to be more representative of the current membership and reflective of the realities of the contemporary world and,

(b) Enlarge the Security Council in order to be more representative of the current UN membership and reflective of the realities of the contemporary world and, In paragraph 1 (b) of Rev.5, the term "*UN*" before membership has been added which is a technical language addition to make the text more precise.

The language on SDG 16.8 has remained consistent in paragraph 1 of Rev.4 and Rev.5. The language on

increase representation of developing countries and small- and medium-sized states, such as Small Island Developing States (SIDS), Arab States and other cross- regional groups.	taking into account our commitments of Sustainable Development Goal 16.8, increase representation of developing countries and smalland medium-sized states.	taking into account our commitments of Sustainable Development Goal 16.8, increase representation of developing countries and smalland medium-sized states.	Small Island Developing States (SIDS), Arab States and other has shifted to paragraph 1 (c) of Rev.4 and Rev.5.
(c) Reach an agreement on the question of categories of membership based on the options outlined in the documents of the IGN, with the understanding that an expansion of 2-year term non-permanent seats will be part of a comprehensive reform.	(c) Continue our discussions on the issue of representation of cross-regional groups, taking into account that Small Island Developing States, Arab States, and others, such as the OIC, have been mentioned in the discussions of the IGN.	(c) Continue discussions on the issue of representation of crossregional groups, taking into account that Small Island Developing States, Arab States, and others, such as the OIC, have been mentioned in the discussions of the IGN.	The language of paragraph 1 (c) in Rev.4 and Rev.5 has remained consistent.
	(d) Intensify our efforts to find an agreement on the question of categories of membership taking into account the discussions held in the IGN process. The reform will include, but not be confined to, an expansion of 2-year term non-permanent seats as part of a comprehensive Security Council reform.	(d) Intensify efforts to find an agreement on the question of the categories of membership taking into account the discussions held in the IGN process. The reform will include, but not be confined to, an expansion of 2-year term non-permanent seats as part of a comprehensive Security Council reform.	The language of paragraph 1 (d) in Rev.4 and Rev.5 has remained consistent.
(d) The total number of an enlarged Council should ensure a balance between the representativeness and effectiveness of an enlarged	(e) The total number of members of an enlarged Council should ensure a balance between its representativeness and effectiveness.	(e) The total number of members of an enlarged Council should ensure a balance between its representativeness and effectiveness.	The language of paragraph 1 (e) in Rev.4 and Rev.5 has remained consistent. The language is based on paragraph 1 (d) of Rev.3.

Council.			
(e) The working methods should ensure the inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable functioning of an enlarged Council.	(f) The working methods should ensure the inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable functioning of an enlarged Council.	(f) The working methods should ensure the inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable functioning of an enlarged Council.	Paragraphs 1 (e) of Rev.3 and paragraph 1 (f) of Rev.4 and Rev.5 have remained consistent.
(f) The question of the veto is a key element of Security Council reform. We will intensify our efforts to reach an agreement on the future of the veto, including discussions on limiting its scope and use.	(g) The question of the veto is a key element of Security Council reform. We will intensify our efforts to reach an agreement on the future of the veto, including discussions on limiting its scope and use.	(g) The question of the veto is a key element of Security Council reform. We will intensify efforts to reach an agreement on the future of the veto, including discussions on limiting its scope and use.	Paragraphs 1 (f) of Rev.3 and paragraph 1 (g) of Rev.4 and Rev.5 have remained consistent.
(g) As part of a comprehensive reform, the inclusion of a review clause should be considered to ensure that the Security Council continues over time to deliver on its mandate and remains fit for purpose.	(h) As part of a comprehensive reform, the inclusion of a review clause should be considered to ensure that the Security Council continues over time to deliver on its mandate and remains fit for purpose.	(h) As part of a comprehensive reform, the inclusion of a review clause should be considered to ensure that the Security Council continues over time to deliver on its mandate and remains fit for purpose.	Paragraphs 1 (g) of Rev.3 and paragraph 1 (h) of Rev.4 and Rev.5 have remained consistent.
Action 2: We will strengthen our efforts in the framework of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on Security Council Reform	Action 2: We will strengthen our efforts in the framework of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on Security Council Reform as a matter of priority and without	Action 2: We will strengthen our efforts in the framework of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on Security Council Reform as a matter of priority and without	The language of Action 2 in Rev.4 and Rev.5 has been strengthened from Rev.3 with the addition of language on "as a matter of priority and without delay".  The language of Action 2 has remained consistent from Rev.4 to Rev.5.

	delay.	delay.	
2. We support the Member States driven nature of the reform, while relying on the efficient and effective provision of resources from the UN system to the IGN process. Building on the recent progress achieved in the IGN, including through more transparency and inclusivity and by enhancing its institutional memory, we agree to:	2. We support the Member States driven nature of the reform of the Security Council, and we will intensify our efforts for the reform through the IGN in accordance with General Assembly Decision 62/557 and other relevant resolutions and decisions of the General Assembly, such as resolution 53/30. Building on the recent progress achieved in the IGN, including through more transparency and inclusivity and by enhancing its institutional memory, we agree to:	2. We support the Member States driven nature of the reform of the Security Council, and will intensify efforts for the reform through the IGN in accordance with General Assembly Decision 62/557 and other relevant resolutions and decisions of the General Assembly, such as resolution 53/30. Building on the recent progress achieved in the IGN, including through more transparency and inclusivity and by enhancing its institutional memory, we decide to:	The language of paragraph 2 in Rev.4 and Rev.5 has remained consistent with the minor tweak of the removal of the word "our" before "efforts for reform" in Rev.5.  The language in Rev.3 paragraph 2 on "while relying on the efficient and effective provision of resources from the UN system to the IGN process" has been deleted. It has been replaced in Rev.4 and Rev.5 with "and we will intensify our efforts for the reform through the IGN in accordance with General Assembly Decision 62/557 and other relevant resolutions and decisions of the General Assembly, such as resolution 53/30."
(a) Encourage the submission of further models and the revision of already presented models by States and Groups of States for the structured dialogues with a view of developing a consolidated model in the future based on models presented by Member States and the discussions on the five clusters.	(a) Encourage the submission of further models and the revision of already presented models by States and Groups of States for the structured dialogues with a view to developing a consolidated model in the future based on convergences on the five clusters and the models presented by Member States.	(a) Encourage the submission of further models and the revision of already presented models by States and Groups of States for the structured dialogues with a view to developing a consolidated model in the future based on convergences on the five clusters, and the models presented by Member States.	The language of paragraph 2 (a) in Rev.4 and Rev.5 has remained consistent.  The language in Rev.3 of paragraph 2 (a) has been reformulated at the end from "based on models presented by Member States and the discussions on the five clusters" to "based on convergences on the five clusters and the models presented by Member States" in Rev.4 and Rev.5.

Action 3: We will strengthen the response of the Security Council for the maintenance of international peace and security and strengthen its relationship with the General Assembly	Action 3: We will strengthen the response of the Security Council for the maintenance of international peace and security and strengthen its relationship with the General Assembly.	Action 3: We will strengthen the response of the Security Council for the maintenance of international peace and security and its relationship with the General Assembly.	The language of Action 3 has remained consistent across Rev.3, Rev.4, and Rev.5 with a tweak in Rev.5  In Action 3 of Rev.5 the word "strengthen" before "its relationship with the General Assembly" has been deleted for readability as the Action starts with "We will strengthen".
3. We commit to continuing to improve and democratize the working methods of the Security Council and strengthening its relationship with the General Assembly, in accordance with and with full respect for their respective functions, authority, powers, and competencies as enshrined in the Charter, with the understanding that this should not substitute the reform of the UN Security Council outlined in Action 1. We agree to:	3. We will continue to improve and democratize the working methods of the Security Council and strengthen its relationship with the General Assembly, in accordance with and with full respect for their respective functions, authority, powers, and competencies as enshrined in the Charter, with the understanding that this should not substitute the reform of the UN Security Council outlined in Action 1. We agree to:	3. We will continue to improve and democratize the working methods of the Security Council and strengthen its relationship with the General Assembly, in accordance with and with full respect for their respective functions, authority, powers, and competencies as enshrined in the Charter, with the understanding that this should not substitute the reform of the UN Security Council outlined in Action 1. We decide to:	The language of paragraph 3 has remained consistent across Rev.4 and Rev.5 with minor language tweaks from Rev.3.
(a) Fully implement and adhere to all provisions of the United Nations Charter as they relate to the decision-making process in the UN Security Council, including Art. 27 (3) of the UN Charter.	(a) Fully implement and adhere to all provisions of the United Nations Charter as they relate to the decision-making process in the UN Security Council, including Art. 27 (3) of the UN Charter.	(a) Fully implement and adhere to all provisions of the United Nations Charter as they relate to the decision-making process in the UN Security Council, including Art. 27 (3) of the UN Charter.	The language of paragraph 3 (a) has remained consistent across Rev.3, Rev.4, and Rev.5.

**DISCLAIMER**: This bulletin aims to provide recent updates and is not a complete summary or official record of the SOTF proceedings. It has been prepared independently and does not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any collaborating organizations. For further details, please reach out to Fergus Watt at <a href="mailto:ferguswatt6@gmail.com">ferguswatt6@gmail.com</a>. The content is freely distributed as it is not copyrighted.

(b) Support credible, timely and decisive action by the Security Council to prevent or end the commission of genocide, crimes against humanity or war crimes.

(b) Support credible, timely and decisive action by the Security Council, in exercise of its primary responsibility for the maintenance of international peace and security, to prevent or end the commission of genocide, crimes against humanity or war crimes.

(b) Support credible, timely and decisive action by the Security Council, in exercise of its primary responsibility for the maintenance of international peace and security, to prevent or end the commission of genocide, crimes against humanity or war crimes.

(c) Actively reinforce the

The language of paragraph 3 (b) has remained consistent across Rev.3, Rev.4, and Rev.5 with the addition of "in exercise of its primary responsibility for the maintenance of international peace and security" in Rev.4 and Rev.5.

The language of paragraph 3 (c) has remained consistent across Rev.3, Rev.4, and Rev.5 with the

addition of "and regional and sub-regional

arrangements" in Rev.4 and Rev.5.

(c) Actively reinforce the ongoing efforts of the Security Council to review and enhance its working methods, including inter alia, penholding and copenholding arrangements, and strengthen the cooperation and communication between the Security Council and the General Assembly and its subsidiary bodies, including the Peacebuilding Commission, as well as the Economic and Social Council, including by continuing to fully implement and make use of General Assembly Resolutions 377A(V)("Uniting for Peace") and 76/262 ("Veto

(d) Improve the participation in

and access to the work of the

(c) Actively reinforce the ongoing efforts of the Security Council to review and enhance its working methods, including inter alia, penholding and copenholding arrangements, and strengthen the cooperation and communication between the Security Council and the General Assembly and its subsidiary bodies, including the Peacebuilding Commission, as well as the Economic and Social Council and regional and subregional arrangements. including by continuing to fully implement and make use of *General Assembly Resolutions 377A(V)* ("Uniting for Peace") and 76/262 ("Veto Initiative").

ongoing efforts of the Security Council to review and enhance its working methods, including inter alia, penholding and copenholding arrangements, and strengthen the cooperation and communication between the Security Council and the General Assembly and its subsidiary bodies, including the Peacebuilding Commission, as well as the Economic and Social Council and regional and subregional arrangements. including by continuing to fully implement and make use of General Assembly Resolutions *377A(V)* ("Uniting for Peace") and 76/262 ("Veto Initiative").

The language of paragraph 3 (d) has remained consistent across Rev.3, Rev.4, and Rev.5.

(d) Improve the participation in and access to the work of the

(d) Improve the participation in and access to the work of the

Initiative").

DISCLAIMER: This bulletin aims to provide recent updates and is not a complete summary or official record of the SOTF proceedings. It has been prepared independently and does not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any collaborating organizations. For further details, please reach out to Fergus Watt at ferguswatt6@gmail.com. The content is freely distributed as it is not copyrighted.

suncil and its organs for all subsidiary organs for all members of the General Assembly, to enhance the countability to the p and increase the cy of its work.  Security Council and its subsidiary organs for all members of the General Assembly, to enhance the Council's accountability to the membership and increase the transparency of its work.  Security Council and its subsidiary organs for all members of the General Assembly, to enhance the Council's accountability to the membership and increase the transparency of its work.
--