

UN-Packing the Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN) Reform of the United Nations Security Council

ABOUT: The Permanent Representatives of Austria and Kuwait to the United Nations in New York have been the Co-Chairs of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other related matters to the Security Council (IGN) during the 78th session of the General Assembly.

The input of the IGN has been submitted to the Co-Facilitators of the Summit of the Future (Germany and Namibia) for inclusion in ‘Chapter V: Transforming global governance’ of the Pact for the Future.

Based on the negotiations, the Co-Facilitators of the IGN process have circulated four revised versions of the language on Security Council Reform to be included in the Pact for the Future. The final input that has been sent to the Co-Facilitators of the Summit of the Future is based on an understanding that it enjoys the widest possible political acceptance among IGN delegations. The current text is based on extensive consultations and in the Co-facilitators’ view, the best compromise achievable, striking a fair balance between the various positions expressed in the framework of the IGN.

METHODOLOGY: This Bulletin endeavours to provide an overview and comparison of how the initial draft of the IGN input (1 May, 2024) has evolved over time to form the latest version (as of 3 July, 2024). The key terminology, language, and paragraphs that were removed, modified, maintained, or added will be identified.

The structure of Rev.1, 2 and 3 are similar with 3 Actions items followed by operative paragraphs. The Zero Draft has a different structure. To provide a comprehensive analysis of the IGN inputs, Rev.1, 2 and 3 will be directly compared and comments on how this has changed from the Zero Draft will be provided. All direct quotes and language from the texts have been italicised. Other comments have been made by the lead author of this bulletin.

RESOURCES:

- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) [Draft Input](#)
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) [Rev.1](#)
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) [Rev.2](#)
- Intergovernmental Negotiations (Security Council Reform) [Rev.3](#)
- All relevant information, documents, and statements on the [intergovernmental negotiations on Security Council reform](#) (IGN).
- [Zero Draft](#) of the Pact for the Future
- [Rev.1](#) of the Pact for the Future

HEADLINES:

- Delegations raised the point that the language contained in the IGN input to the Pact for the Future should be more concise and adapted to the purposes of a high-level document. Some delegations mentioned that the language should be “leader-like”. Others stressed the need for clear, operative and ambitious results.
- Rev.3 (the latest iteration) of the IGN input is split into three core action items:
 1. Action 1: We will reform the UN Security Council, recognizing the urgent need to make it more representative, inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable.
 2. Action 2: We will strengthen our efforts in the framework of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on Security Council Reform as a matter of priority and without delay.
 3. Action 3: We will strengthen the response of the Security Council for the maintenance of international peace and security and strengthen its relationship with the General Assembly.

HEADLINES:

- The principles of making the Security Council more “representative, inclusive, transparent, efficient, effective, democratic and accountable” have remained in Rev.2 and Rev.3. However, similar to the changes from Rev.2 to Rev.3, the language has become stronger and more action-oriented in Rev.3.
- References to “introducing a repository of the IGN with a dedicated website” and the appeal for Security Council Reform of 2005 as seen in the Draft Input have been removed in Rev.3.
- The substance of the language on the historical injustice against Africa has remained consistent from the Zero Draft with minor tweaks in language. References to SDG 16.8 in Rev.3 are based on paragraph 1 of Rev.2, paragraph 2 of Rev.1, and paragraph 2 of the Draft Input.
- The addition of Arab States is based on paragraph 1 (a) of Rev.2. Reference to the Arab States did not feature in the Draft Input or Rev.1.
- Reference to the OIC (Organisation of Islamic Cooperation) did not feature in any of the previous drafts and is a new addition to Rev.3. In Rev.3, the language has changed to “*Continue our discussions on the issue of representation*” signalling that delegations require further deliberations on this.
- Language on the reform including, but not confined to, an “expansion of 2-year term non-permanent seats” has remained consistent since the Draft Input. Reference to the range of the number of seats (21 to 27 seats) as referenced in paragraph 3 (d) of the Draft Input featured in Rev.1 (paragraph 1 bullet point 4) and Rev.2 (paragraph 1 (d) but has been removed only from Rev.3.
- The language on the question of the veto has remained relatively consistent since the Draft Input.

- The language on limiting the veto’s “scope and use” has altered and did not feature in Rev.2. It has, however, been re-inserted into Rev.3.
- The language on the “inclusion of a review clause” has remained consistent since the Draft Input. Reference to “in accordance with General Assembly Decision 62/557” has remained consistent from the Draft Input to Rev.3. The addition of “and other relevant resolutions and decisions of the General Assembly, such as resolution 53/30” in Rev.3 is new and did not feature in any previous texts.
- The language of Action 3 in Rev.3 has shifted from a focus on strengthening “the response of the United Nations system” to a focus on strengthening the Security Council’s response for “the maintenance of international peace and security” and “its relationship with the General Assembly”.
- The latter half of paragraph 3 (bullet point 2) of Rev.1 on adopting a “General Assembly resolution clarifying the interpretation of the term “party to a dispute” in Art. 27 (3) of the UN Charter in order to ensure the full implementation of this provision” has been removed from Rev.3. This language also featured in paragraph 6 (b) of the Draft Input.
- The language of paragraph 3 (b) of Rev.3 is of a different meaning to that of Rev.1 and the Draft Input. Rev.1 and the Draft Input call on Member States to “Consider committing to not vote against a credible draft resolution before the Security Council” and to commit to “not prevent the Security Council from taking action with the aim of preventing or bringing an end to situations involving the commission of mass atrocities by the use of the veto”. Language on not voting against resolutions and mass atrocities have been removed from Rev.2 and Rev.3.
- While language on “more significant contributions from elected members such as serving as penholder” did feature in the Draft Input, the language on reviewing and enhancing the Security Council’s working methods including “penholding and co-penholding arrangements” in Rev.3 is new and did not feature in previous texts.
- Language on “General Assembly Resolutions 377A(V) (“Uniting for Peace”) and 76/262 (“Veto Initiative”)” is verbatim from the latter part of paragraphs 3 (d) in Rev.2 and paragraph 3 (bullet point 4) of Rev.1.

General references / language that were found in the Draft Input, Rev.1, and/or Rev.2 that have been removed in Rev.3 of the Intergovernmental Negotiations on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and other related matters to the Security Council (IGN). Note that this is not an exhaustive list:

- Recalling our appeal for Security Council Reform of 2005
- Webcasting of parts of the IGN sessions
- Introducing a repository of the IGN with a dedicated website
- Overall range of 21-27 seats

- Note 507
- Increasing the frequency and improving the conduct of Security Council missions
- Fully making use of the different meeting formats available
- Committing to not vote against a credible draft resolution before the Security Council
- Permanent Members committing to not prevent the Security Council from taking action
- Situations involving the commission of mass atrocities by the use of the veto
- Request the President of the General Assembly to appoint Co-Chairs for the Intergovernmental Negotiations in order to immediately continue negotiations
- Call on Member States to provide the President of the General Assembly with the necessary resources to support the process of Security Council reform and in this regard consider the establishment of a dedicated unit in the Office of the President of the General Assembly for the Security Council reform process
- Request the Secretary General to ensure the provision of the necessary expertise, especially through the Office of Legal Affairs, the Security Council Affairs Division and the Department for General Assembly and Conference Management (DGACM) as appropriate and as requested by the Co-Chairs and OPGA.
- Adopt a resolution clarifying the interpretation of the term “party to a dispute” in Art. 27 (3) of the UN Charter in order to ensure the full implementation of this provision
- Examine the establishment of a mechanism that ensures automatic consequences in the case of grave violations of the UN Charter.



Rev. 	
	    